Reading and Writing Arguments

AP Language Unit 2
Lesson 1: What is Argument?

- A conflict?
- A contest to prove another wrong?
- A battle with words?
- A process of reasoned inquiry and rational discourse seeking common ground?

If it is the last point, we engage in argument whenever we explore ideas rationally and think clearly about the world.
What Argument has become...

- Raised voices interrupting one another
- Exaggerated assertions without adequate support
- Scanty evidence from sources that lack credibility
Toles argues that the tragic shooting in Arizona which killed six and injured 13 was spurred on by violent language.
Crazed Rhetoric

Can it be tamed?

Is this view exaggerated?
What's the Goal?

From Here
- Partisanship
- Polarization
- Adversarial view
- Winners and Losers

To Here
- Persuasive discourse
- Coherent and considered movement from claim to conclusion
- Mutual Understanding
- A means of better understanding other peoples’ ideas as well as your own
So What Does a Civil Argument Look Like?

- “Why Investing in Fast Food May Be a Good Thing”
- Amy Domini
  - Financial advisor and voice for social responsibility in investing
- Ode Magazine 2009
Close Reading

- Closely read
- Annotate and Write in the Margins
  - Trace some of Domini’s methods
    - Use of appeals (ethos, logos, pathos)
    - Evidence
    - Examples
Domini Article Debrief (add to notes)

- Identify at least two points in the article where Domini could have given way to accusation or blame or where she could have dismissed the Slow Food movement as being shortsighted or elitist (for wealthy people).
- Discuss how, instead, she finds common ground and promotes dialogue with her audience through civil discourse (Rogerian argument).
Rogerian Argument

- **Rogerian argument** is a negotiating strategy in which common goals are identified and opposing views are described as objectively as possible in an effort to establish common ground and reach an agreement.
Lesson 2: Claims

- Every argument has a CLAIM
- CLAIMS state the argument’s main idea
- CLAIMS are also called assertions or propositions
What a CLAIM is not...

- It can't just be a simple statement of fact
- It isn’t just a topic
- For example:
  - In the essay we just read, the general topic is social investing – (specifically, social investing in the fast-food industry)
  - The arguable claim, however, is that investing in fast-food companies can be socially responsible.

**NOTICE:**
The TOPIC can be a word or two, but the CLAIM must be stated as a sentence.
Only after studying a topic closely can a writer, student OR professional develop a STRONG CLAIM

- A simple statement does not indicate whether you support a notion or challenge it.
- Which of these is a TOPIC, a DETAIL, or a CLAIM?
  - Many schools have single-sex classrooms
  - Single-sex classrooms are ineffective because they do not prepare students for realities of the workplace.
  - Single-sex classrooms have been around for years, especially in private schools.
Arguable? Or too easily verifiable to develop an argument? Revise two of the verifiable statements into arguable claims.

1. SUV owners should be required to pay an energy surcharge.
2. Charter schools are an alternative to public schools.
3. Ronald Reagan was the most charismatic president of the twentieth century.
4. Requiring students to wear uniforms improves school spirit.
5. The terms *global warming* and *climate change* describe different perspectives on this complex issue.
6. Students graduating from college today can expect to have more debt than any previous generation.
7. The competition among countries to host an Olympic Games is fierce.
8. Plagiarism is a serious problem in today’s schools.
Types of Claims

Claims of Fact
- Is something true? Or untrue?

Claims of Value
- Is something good? Or bad?

Claims of Policy
- Is change needed? In action? In attitude?
### What is an arguable claim of fact?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Zimbabwe is in Africa</th>
<th>Zimbabwe has an unstable government</th>
<th>Zippys serves a wide variety of food</th>
<th>Zippys is more popular with old people than young people</th>
<th>What does “unstable” mean? What does “popular” mean? What defines older versus younger?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Claims of Fact

- Arguments of fact can pivot on what exactly is “factual”
- Facts become arguable when they are questioned, when they raise controversy, when they challenge people’s beliefs
- So-called facts can be matters of interpretations
- New facts call into question older ones
Domini’s Claims of Fact

- Fast food is a way of life
  - Sales stats support this claim
- Fast food is a global phenomenon
  - Fast food around the world (Greece example)
- Arguments of fact can challenge stereotypes of social beliefs
### Claims of Value

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Must be arguable, but can be based on personal taste</th>
<th>Establish specific criteria or standards</th>
<th>Show to what extent the subject meets your criteria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

- Must be arguable, but can be based on personal taste
- Establish specific criteria or standards
- Show to what extent the subject meets your criteria
Domini’s Claims of Value

- Implicit in the title
- Supports this claim by discussing the impact of food choices
So How Does This Movie Review Present and Support its Claim of Value?

- “Star Wars”
- Roger Ebert (1942-2013)
  - Late, great film critic
  - TV show – Siskel and Ebert
  - Thumbs-up!
Trace the analysis of Ebert’s argument that Star Wars truly is a great movie (and it certainly is).

Where is Ebert’s CLAIM of Value?

How does Star Wars meet the criteria? In other words, WHAT makes it such a good movie?
Bonus Ticket Assignment:

- Find a review of a movie, a TV show, a concert, a CD, or a book, a game, or an electronic device. Identify the claim in the review. What criteria does the reviewer use to justify a thumbs-up or a thumbs-down?
- Cite where you read the review
- Paraphrase the review in a few sentences on a piece of paper or your notebook

OR

WRITE YOUR OWN REVIEW of movie, a TV show, a concert, a CD, or a book, a game, or an electronic device. Identify your claims in the review. What criteria did you use to justify a thumbs-up or a thumbs-down rating?
**Claims of Policy**

- **Define the Problem (Claim of Fact)**
- **Explain why it is a problem (Claim of Value)**
- **Explain the change that needs to happen (Claim of Policy)**
Claims of Policy Can Be Personal/Local/Global

• Proposing a class fundraiser for the victims of natural disasters
• Proposing that your parents let you spend more time with your friends
• Proposing that the U.S. moves to alternative energy sources

Arguments of Policy Propose Action/Change

• Direct Action
• Change of Attitude or Viewpoint
In an argument for a change of policy, more than one type of claim here is used.

- “The C Word in the Hallways”
- Anna Quindlen
- Newsweek Magazine 1999
- Read excerpt
- What is Quindlen’s Claim?
“The saddest phrase I’ve read in a long time is this one: psychological autopsy. That’s what the doctors call it when a kid kills himself and they go back over the plowed ground of his short life, and discover all the hidden markers that led to the rope, the blade, the gun.”
“There’s a plague on all our houses, and since it doesn’t announce itself with lumps or spots or protest marches, it has gone unremarked in the quiet suburbs and busy cities where it has been laying waste. The number of suicides and homicides committed by teenagers, most often young men, has exploded in the last three decades, until it has become commonplace to have black-bordered photographs in yearbooks and murder suspects with acne problems. And everyone searches for reasons, and scapegoats, and solutions, most often punitive. Yet one solution continues to elude us, and that is ending the ignorance about mental health, and moving it from the margins of care and into the mainstream where it belongs. As surely as any vaccine, this would save lives.”
Par 2. So many have already been lost. This month Kip Kinkel was sentenced to life in prison in Oregon for the murders of his parents and a shooting rampage at his high school that killed two students. A psychiatrist who specializes in the care of adolescents testified that Kinkel, now 17, had been hearing voices since he was 12. Sam Manzie is also 17. He is serving a 70-year sentence for luring an 11-year-old boy named Eddie Werner into his New Jersey home and strangling him with the cord of an alarm clock because his Sega Genesis was out of reach. Manzie had his first psychological evaluation in the first grade.
Quindlen’s essay continues further

- **What is important to note:**
  - As she develops her argument, she supports the claim of policy by considering both personal examples and general facts about mental health in America.
  - To arrive at this claim of policy, she first makes a claim of value, then of fact.
  - Perform a close reading of the essay, annotating to show how Quindlen backs up all three claims with appropriate evidence and how she uses appeals (ethos, logos, and/or pathos).
Identify the claims of fact, value and policy in this NY Times Editorial

- “Felons and the Right to Vote” 2004
- UPDATE: Florida voted to restore voting rights to ex-felons in November 2018, with the exception of those convicted of murder or sexual felonies.
Close Reading: *Felons and the Right to Vote*

- Closely read
- Annotate and Write in the Margins
  - Label the Claims of Fact, Policy and Value
Felons and Right to Vote: Write this graphic organizer down in your notes – In pairs, write down one example for each column.

- Be aware of the author’s use of evidence
- Differentiate between claim and evidence

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fact</th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Policy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Lesson 3: From Claim to Thesis

- To develop a claim into a thesis, you have to be SPECIFIC
- Anna Quindlen’s main idea is stated explicitly here:
  - Yet one solution continues to elude us, and that is ending the ignorance about mental health, and moving it from the margins of care and into the mainstream where it belongs. As surely as any vaccine, this would save lives.

- Change proposed
- Reinforced by analogy

- NOTE: Sometimes in professional essays, the central claim may be IMPLICIT, but in formal academic essays, make your central claim EXPLICIT (Not in a bad way…)
Types of Thesis Statements

Closed
- **Main Idea + Preview of Main Points**
  - Limits the number of points
  - Good way to focus a short, possibly TIMED essay
  - EXPLICITLY states the points
  - Helps the writer address the prompt

Open
- **Main Idea**
  - Good for longer essays
  - Does not force the reader to keep track of 5-10 main points
  - Can be more artful, less formulaic

Counterargument
- **Summary of Counterargument + Writer’s Opinion**
  - Advantageous in that it immediately addressed the naysayer
  - Uses the qualifiers “although” or “but”
  - Can lead to more thorough concession and refutation later on
  - Can lead to a more moderate position rather than absolutes
### Types of Thesis Statements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Closed</th>
<th>Open</th>
<th>Counterargument</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Main Idea + Preview of Main Points**  
The Harry Potter series has become a legendary and enduring literary classic because of its three-dimensional characters, exciting plot, and complex themes. | **Main Idea**  
The popularity of the Harry Potter series demonstrates that simplicity trumps complexity when it comes to the tastes of readers young and old. | **Summary of Counterargument + Writer’s Opinion**  
Although the Harry Potter series may have some literary merit, its popularity has less to do with storytelling than with merchandising. |
Creating Thesis Templates

Closed

• Main Idea + Preview of Main Points
  • ____ (topic) ______ has become a ____ (adj.) ______ and ___ (adj.) ___ ___ (noun renames the topic) ______ because of its ____ (point #1) __ , __ (point #2) __ , and ___ (point #3) ______

Open

• Main Idea
  • The popularity of the ______ (topic) ______ demonstrates that ______ (trumps/exceeds/overpowers) ______ when it comes to ______ (trump/exceeds/overpowers) ______.

Counterargument

• Summary of Counterargument + Writer's Opinion
  • Although ______ (topic) ______ may ______ , its ______ (popularity/benefit) has less to do with ______ than with ______.  

• A blank space for additional information or notes.
Practice

- Develop a thesis statement that could focus an argument in response to the prompts on the following slide.
- Discuss with your partner what you think the structure should be – closed, open, or counterargument.

Example:
- Prompt: Today’s world is full of conflicts and controversies. Choose a local or global issue, and write an essay that considers multiple viewpoints and proposes a solution or compromise.
- Thesis (Closed) “A lack of financial education for young people could result in lasting economic hardship well into adulthood. We need to educate our youth about budgeting, saving and recognizing the difference between ‘good’ and ‘bad’ debt.”
Prompts

1. Same-gender classrooms have gone in and out of favor in public education. Write an essay explaining why you would support or oppose same-gender classrooms for public schools in grades 10-12.

2. Write an essay explaining why you agree or disagree with the following quotation: “Advertising degrades the people it appeals to; it deprives them of their will to choose.”

3. Plagiarism is rampant in high schools and colleges. In fact, some people argue that the definition of plagiarism has changed because of the Internet. Write an essay explaining what you believe the appropriate response of a teacher should be to a student who turns in a plagiarized essay or exam.
Lesson #4: Evidence

Claim  Thesis  Evidence
What evidence should be presented?

How much is needed?

How should it be presented?

AUDIENCE???
Evidence Should Be:

- Relevant
- Accurate
- Specific
Logical Fallacies

- Potential vulnerabilities or weaknesses in an argument
- Failure to make a connection between a claim and the evidence used to support the claim
- The breakdown in most weak arguments occurs in the use of evidence, since evidence is what we use to prove arguments
- Fallacies can be accidental, or used deliberately to manipulate or deceive
- Check for fallacies when reading and when writing
- As we learn about specific fallacies, remember that the concepts are more important than the terms
Fallacies of Relevancy
- Red Herring
- Ad Hominem

Fallacies of Accuracy
- Straw Man
- Either/Or or False Dilemma

Fallacies of Insufficiency
- Hasty Generalization
- Circular Reasoning
Types of Evidence

First-Hand
- Accessed via memory, or recollection of what others have told you
- Personal Experience
- Anecdotes
- Current Events
- APPEALS TO: PATHOS

Second-Hand
- Accessed via research, reading, investigation
- Historical Information
- Expert Opinion
- ESTABLISHES: ETHOS
- APPEALS TO: LOGOS

Quantitative
- Accessed via research, reading, investigation
- Statistics
- Surveys
- Polls
- Census Information
- ESTABLISHES: ETHOS
- APPEALS TO: LOGOS
Analyze the Use of Personal Experience

- “Why Can’t Environmentalism be Colorblind?”
- Jennifer Oladipo
- Orion Magazine 2007
Close Reading

- Closely read
- Annotate and Write in the Margins
  - Label Evidence (Personal Experience, Quantitative, or Historical)
Types of Evidence: “Environmentalism”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Personal Experience</th>
<th>Quantitative/Historical</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Types of Evidence: “Environmentalism”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Personal Experience</th>
<th>Quantitative/Historical</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Par 1 – She describes her volunteering: no other black woman came to the center</td>
<td>Par 4: Reference to how other groups like religious, military have included and recruited across racial spectrum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Par 2 – She noticed the mailer were only going to white neighborhoods</td>
<td>Par 5: Minorities make up 1/3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Par 4 – She received political flyers, but had to seek out env. Groups herself</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Par 6 – She says that like her, other minorities enjoy outdoors</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Par 6 – Also, minorities who can, are buying organic, hybrid</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In your textbooks...

- Turn to pages 101-108
- Be prepared to discuss the types of evidence used as a class.
- Take notes in your notebook filling in the last column with 1-2 examples of evidence.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Evidence</th>
<th>Sample Text</th>
<th>Examples</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>First Hand: Anecdote</td>
<td>“In College, These American Citizens Are Not Created Equal” Fabiola Santiago (op-ed piece – Miami Herald)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First Hand: Current Events</td>
<td>“When Will We Learn” Fareed Zakaria (Time Magazine, November 2011)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second Hand: Historical Information</td>
<td><em>Hate Speech: The History of and American Controversy</em> by Samuel Walker, 1994</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantitative: Statistics and Fact</td>
<td>Amy Domini (Investing in Fast Food) and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Hasty Generalization**
“Pulling wisdom teeth is just another unnecessary and painful medical procedure. I still have all of mine, and they haven’t given me problems.”

**Post Hoc Ergo Propter Hoc**
(After which therefore because of which)
“We elected Johnson as president and look where it got us: hurricanes, flash floods, stock market crashes.

**Appeal to False Authority**
A TV star is not a medical expert, even though drug companies often use celebrity endorsements

**Bandwagon Appeal**
“You should vote to elect Rachel Johnson – she has a strong lead in the polls.”
Other Fallacies

- Ad Baculum: Appeal to Fear
  - “If you don’t give that to me, I’m going to make you pay.”

- Hypothesis Contrary to Fact
  - “If I hadn’t had Mr. Chang for Algebra, I never would have passed AP Calculus.”

- Ad misericordium (Appeal to Pity)
  - “If you don’t give me an ‘A’ I will lose my scholarship.”

- Post Hoc Ergo Propter Hoc (After which therefore because of which)
  - “We elected Johnson as president and look where it got us: hurricanes, flash floods, stock market crashes.”
Identify the logical fallacy in each example

1. What is the problem? All my friends have curfew at midnight!
2. A person who is honest does not steal, so my client, an honest person, clearly is not guilty of theft.
3. Her economic plan is impressive, but remember; this is a woman who spent six weeks in rehab.
4. Since Mayor Perry has been in office, our city has had a balanced budget; if he were governor, the state budget will be balanced.
5. If we outlaw guns, only outlaws will have guns.
6. Smoking is dangerous because it is harmful to your health.
7. He was last year’s MVP and he drives a Volvo. That must a be a great car.
8. A national study of grades 6-8 showed that test scores went down last year and absenteeism was high; this generation is going to the dogs.
Fallacy Alert! Answers

1. What is the problem? All my friends have curfew at midnight! BANDWAGON
2. A person who is honest does not steal, so my client, an honest person, clearly is not guilty of theft. CIRCULAR
3. Her economic plan is impressive, but remember; this is a woman who spent six weeks in rehab. AD HOMINEM
4. Since Mayor Perry has been in office, our city has had a balanced budget; if he were governor, the state budget will be balanced. FALSE ANALOGY
5. If we outlaw guns, only outlaws will have guns. EITHER/OR
6. Smoking is dangerous because it is harmful to your health. BEGS THE QUESTION

1. He was last year’s MVP and he drives a Volvo. That must a be a great car. FALSE AUTHORITY
2. A national study of grades 6-8 showed that test scores went down last year and absenteeism was high; this generation is going to the dogs. HASTY GENERALIZATION
Analyze Evidence’s Connection with the Appeals

- “Terror’s Purse Strings”
- Dana Thomas
- New York Times Op-Ed
- Writes regularly for Newsweek Magazine
- August 30, 2007
Close Reading

- Closely read
- Annotate and Write in the Margins
  - Label each type of evidence
- In GROUPS, make a CHART for your assigned section (Par. 1-3, 4-6, 7-9)
  - Paragraph #
  - Type of Evidence
- “How does each type of evidence appeal to ethos, logos and/or pathos?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Par #</th>
<th>Type of Evidence</th>
<th>Evaluate use of appeal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Lesson #5: Argument Structure

Audience

Purpose

Shape of an Argument
Lesson #5: Argument Structure

- Classical Oration
- Induction
- Deduction
- Toulmin Model
The Classical Oration

**Introduction (exordium)**
Announcing the purpose

**Narration (narratio)**
Context – or “narrative” of what has occurred

**Confirmation (confirmatio)**
Proof and Logical Reasoning

**Refutation (refutatio)**
Answering the Counterarguments

**Conclusion (peroratio)**
Summary of the Argument
“Not By Math Alone”
Sandra Day O’Connor (retired Supreme Court justice)
Roy Romer (former Governor of Colorado)
Washington Post
March, 2006
Close Reading

- Closely read
- Annotate and Write in the Margins
  - Trace and Label the parts of the classical argument structure
On your small paper...

- Write the paragraph #s for each of the five sections of the classical oration:
  - Introduction
  - Narration
  - Confirmation
  - Refutation
  - Conclusion
Classical Oration Model: “Not By Math…”

- Introduction – Paragraphs 1-2
- Narration- Paragraphs 3-6
- Confirmation – Paragraphs 7-12
- Refutation – Paragraph 13
- Conclusion – Paragraph 14
Lesson #5 Argument Structure: Induction

Specific Case

General Conclusion

Specific Case

Specific Case
Lesson #5 Argument Structure: Induction

Exercise contributes to better health

Exercise lowers stress levels

Regular exercise promotes weight loss

Exercise improves mood and outlook
How does Gladwell Use Induction?

- “from Outliers”
- Malcolm Gladwell
Close Reading

- Closely read
- Annotate
  - Underline: Claims (arguable statements)
  - Circle: Key Words/Terms
  - Bracket Evidence
- Write in the Margins
  - What kinds of claims and evidence lead up to Gladwell’s inference that “when it comes to math, Asians have a built-in advantage”? 
Provide examples of claims and evidence that lead up to Gladwell’s conclusion. (Trace his use of induction)

- “When it comes to math, Asians have a built-in advantage.”
- The attitude toward math is that “math is sensible” and SHOULD be easy to understand.
- The logic makes “math anxiety” obsolete.
- Chinese number naming has implicit logic which helps children learn functions faster.
Provide examples of claims and evidence that lead up to Gladwell’s conclusion. (Trace his use of induction)

“The Chinese numbering system is logical: the meaning is implicit in the linguistic structure.

“When it comes to math, Chinese speakers have a built-in advantage.”

Because English numbering system is inconsistent, children may not find as much success in math early on.

Saying numbers in Chinese is faster, and therefore, people can hold more numbers in memory.
When it comes to math, Chinese speakers have a built-in advantage.

Asian children may experience math as a sensible, accessible subject, and then children may find more success in math earlier — and enjoyment.

Counting/number system in Chinese is more logical and consistent than English.

Chinese number linguistic structure takes less time to say and so memorizing number fact can be easier.
Provide examples of claims and evidence that lead up to Gladwell’s conclusion. (Trace his use of induction)

Asian languages’ logical counting system makes basic math easier at a younger age

“When it comes to math, Chinese speakers have a built-in advantage.”

Chinese number words have a linguistic structure that make lists of numbers easier to retain

The language of math comes more quickly because it is embedded in the language itself
Deduction

- Start with the general
- Apply to specific cases

- Everyone in this classroom is a strong student.
- Max and Quinn are in this classroom.
- Max and Quinn are strong students.
Syllogisms are a form of Deduction

- Universal Truth or General Principle (Major Premise)
- Applied to a specific case (Minor Premise)
- Leading to the necessary conclusion
Exercise contributes to better health

Yoga is a type of exercise

Yoga contributes to better health

If the first two premises are true, then the conclusion is logically valid
Deduction Examples

Celebrities are role models for young people + Lindsey Lohan is a celebrity = Lindsey Lohan is a role model for young people

If either of the two premises is false or can be questioned, the conclusion is subject to challenge. Although this conclusion is LOGICALLY VALID, is it TRUE?
Deduction can be a way to combat stereotypes based on faulty premises. Breaking an idea like this one into component parts helps expose the basic thinking which can then lead to a more nuanced argument. This example might be qualified, for instance, by saying that some women are poor drivers; Ms. Suehiro might be a poor driver in that case.
Combining Induction and Deduction

- Analyze the use of induction and deduction in combination

- Two documents: (Choose ONE)
  - Thomas Jefferson – The Declaration of Independence
  - Elizabeth Cady Stanton – The Declaration of Sentiments

- Write down and example of both inductive and deductive reasoning. Your example of deductive reasoning can be written in the form of a syllogism.

- How does the author use induction and deduction in order to support their claim and develop their argument?
Declaration of Sentiments

- AS INDIVIDUALS Read closely
- Mark the Text
  - Underline Claims
  - Bracket Evidence
  - Circle Key Words
  - Put a box around words you don’t know
- IN GROUPS: Write down one example of how Cady Stanton uses INDUCTION and one example of DEDUCTION
Complete two models:
Inductive
Deductive
Complete two models: 
Inductive 

Deductive

All American citizens have equal rights under the law

Women are American Citizens

Women should have same rights as men

Have to obey the law, but have no say

Not allowed right to education

Income/Allowance goes to men if divorced

Women are treated unfairly regardless of marital status
Complete two models:
Inductive

Deductive

All (men) citizens of Britain are equal

Colonists are British citizens

Colonists should have the same rights as all British citizens

King George is unfit to rule the Colonies

He has imposed trade embargos that have harmed the Colonies

He has prohibited Colonist representation in British Parliament

He has allowed his army to commit crimes against the Colonists
Lesson #5 Argument Structure: The Toulmin Model

- Created by Stephen Toulmin, British philosopher, in 1958
- A useful tool in uncovering assumptions that underlie arguments

Six Elements:
- Claim
- Support (Evidence/Data)
- Warrant/Assumption
- Backing
- Qualifier
- Reservation
Lesson #5 Continued: Toulmin Model
The Toulmin Model

- CLAIM – This we have discussed extensively – arguable assertions

I should take my umbrella
The Toulmin Model

- SUPPORT/EVIDENCE – This we have also covered in detail – first hand, second hand, quantitative

It is raining
The Toulmin Model

- WARRANT – Expresses the assumption that is necessarily \textit{SHARED} by the speaker and the audience \textit{LINKING} the claim to the evidence

- \textbf{NOTE:} If the speaker and audience \textit{DO NOT SHARE} the same assumption regarding the claim – all the evidence in the world won’t be enough to sway them!

An umbrella will keep me dry
The Toulmin Model

- BACKING – Further assurances or data which lend more authority

The material is waterproof
The Toulmin Model

- QUALIFIER – (usually, probably, maybe, in most cases)
  Tempers the claim, making it less absolute

Probably
The Toulmin Model

- RESERVATION – Explains the terms and conditions necessitated by the QUALIFIER. In many cases, the argument can also contain a REBUTTAL that addresses the “naysayer.”

Unless it has a hole in it
The Toulmin Model

Evidence: It is raining

Assumption/Warrant: An umbrella will keep me dry

Qualifier: Probably

Reservation: Unless it has a hole in it

Backing: The material is waterproof

Claim: I should take my umbrella
The Toulmin Model

- Because (evidence as support), therefore (claim), since (assumption/warrant), on account of (backing), unless (reservation).

SIMPLE: Because it is raining, therefore I should take my umbrella, since it will keep me dry.

The FULL argument:

Because it is raining, therefore I should probably take my umbrella, since it will keep me dry on account of its waterproof material, unless, of course, there is a hole in it.
Analyzing Assumptions

Assumptions are the links between the Claim and the Evidence/Data
Analyzing Assumptions

- If the audience shares the assumption, it is more likely that they will agree with the claim.

- If asked to analyze an argument to determine whether you support or challenge the claim, finding a vulnerability in the assumption would be the place to start.
How Assumptions Can Become Arguable Claims

- Use the Toulmin model to paraphrase Amy Domini’s argument:

  - Because the fast food industry continues to grow and is not going away, therefore even those of us who support Slow Food should invest in it, since investing has the power to persuade businesses to change.

- Where is the assumption that the audience must agree upon in order for Domini’s argument to be persuasive?
How Assumptions Can Become Arguable Claims

- Use the Toulmin model to paraphrase Fareed Zakaria’s argument.
  
  Because Chinese and South Korean children spend almost two years more in school than do Americans, therefore they outperform Americans on tests, since increased instructional time is responsible for increased test scores.

- Where is the assumption that the audience must agree upon in order for Zakaria’s argument to be persuasive?
How Assumptions Can Become Arguable Claims

- Use the Toulmin model to paraphrase Fareed Zakaria’s argument.
  
  Because foreign students spend more time in school and achieve higher test scores, therefore they receive a better education, since quality of education and learning is indicated by test scores, on account of their accuracy in assessing learning.

- Where is the assumption that the audience must agree upon in order for Zakaria’s argument to be persuasive?
Sometimes Claims are IMPLICIT—Use Toulmin to help you figure out what they are

For example: “The C word in the Hallways” Anna Quindlen

So many have already been lost. This month Kip Kinkel was sentenced to life in prison in Oregon for the murders of his parents and a shooting rampage at his high school that killed two students. A psychiatrist who specializes in the care of adolescents testified that Kinkel, now 17, had been hearing voices since he was 12. Sam Manzie is also 17. He is serving a 70-year sentence for luring an 11-year-old boy named Eddie Werner into his New Jersey home and strangling him with the cord of an alarm clock because his Sega Genesis was out of reach. Manzie had his first psychological evaluation in the first grade.
Find the IMPLICIT claim in Quindlen’s article

- Because Kinkel and Manzie’s illnesses were known years before they committed murder (evidence), therefore ________ (claim) ______________ since ________________ (assumption) ________________ ______.

- The entire argument rests on the assumption that _________________________________.

- This provokes discussion, right? Perhaps this is the point of vulnerability in Quindlen’s argument.
For each of the statements on the next slide, identify the assumption that links the claim to its support

- Use the following to discover the assumption:
  - “Because (support), therefore (claim), since (assumption), on the account of (backing), unless (reservation).”
  - ALSO, decide which statements would require a QUALIFIER
“Because (support), therefore (claim), since (assumption), on the account of (backing), unless (reservation).”

ALSO, decide which statements would require a QUALIFIER

1. Grades should be abolished because they add stress to the learning experience.
2. Until you buy me a diamond, I won’t know that you love me!
3. Everyone should read novels because they make us more understanding of human foibles and frailties.
4. If we want to decrease gang violence, we should legalize drugs.
5. Don’t get married if you believe that familiarity breeds contempt.
6. WiFi should be available to everyone without cost since the Internet has become a vital part of our lives.
7. You must obey her because she is your mother.
8. We need to equip all classrooms with the latest computer technology.
“Because (support), therefore (claim), since (assumption), on the account of (backing), unless (reservation).”

1. Grades should be abolished because they add stress to the learning experience.

   “Because grades add stress, therefore grades should be abolished, since stress CAN BE bad for your physical and mental health, on account of the fact that stress can lead to depression and pain, unless the stress is channeled in a positive way to reach a desired outcome.
Lesson #6: From Reading to Writing

- The Toulmin model is a tool for reading argument, and it can also help bring logic to written arguments.
- “But it’s awkward!”
- True. By eliminating some of the artificial constructions like “because, therefore and since” it can help you create a strong thesis statement, or at least think through the logic of your argument fully.
One reason education in this country is so bad is that the textbooks are crammed full of fluff like charts and graphs and pictures.

Because textbook authors are filling their books with charts, graphs and pictures, therefore the quality of education is declining in this country, since less written information equals less learning.
Visual and Print Media – Component Parts

Evidence: Because textbook authors are filling their books with charts, graphs and pictures, therefore the quality of education is declining in this country, since less written information equals less learning.

Claim:

Assumption/Warrant:

Backing:
Visual and Print Media – Component Parts

**Evidence:** Textbooks contain charts, graphs, pictures

**Assumption/Warrant:** Learning comes from written text

**Backing:** Traditionally students have learned from written text

**Claim:** Education is declining
Just because it’s a template, it doesn’t mean it has to tie your hands intellectually. Put forth any viewpoint that you like-→
Using Toulmin to Craft a Response

Because charts, graphs, and pictures provide information, Therefore they do not hinder the educational system, Since that information is a supplement to written text. You could then use this statement to develop your position and to write the thesis for your essay.
Using Toulmin to Craft a Response

- This example presents the claim, but doesn’t argue with the data; it acknowledges its validity, as far as it goes:
  - Creating a reasonable, rationale tone
  - Appeals to ethos
  - Appeals to logos
  - Focuses in on the assumption with a pair of rhetorical questions

Much of the argument is indisputable; however, some of it can be interpreted in different ways. Take, for instance, the criticism of textbooks for using too many visuals, particularly of a map replacing a topographical description. Is the map really a bad thing? Are any of the charts and graphs bad things?
Practice by completing the following templates, using an argument from this chapter: Crazed Rhetoric cartoon, Domini or Ebert articles... modify these as needed.

1. In his/her argument, _______ concludes _______ and supports the conclusion with such evidence as _______ and _______. To link this conclusion with the evidence, he/she makes the assumption that _______.

2. Although what ____ says about _____ may be true in some cases, his/her position fails to take ______ into account. A closer look at _____ reveals _______.

3. One way to look at X would be to say _______; but if that were the case, then _______. Of course, another view might be _______. Yet another way to consider X might be ___.

4. While the position advanced by X may seem reasonable, it assumes _______. If that were so, then_______. It might be more reasonable to consider ________.

5. Position X would be sound if we chose to ignore______. When we consider ________________, then___________________________.

Lesson #7: Analyzing Visual Texts as Arguments

- What are some examples of visual texts that present arguments?
Lesson #7: Analyzing Visual Texts as Arguments

- What are some examples of visual texts that present arguments?
  - Advertisement
  - Political cartoon
  - Photograph
  - Bumper sticker
  - T-shirt
  - Hat
  - Web page
  - Fine art
Use Handout “Questions for Analyzing Visual Text”
HOW does this cartoon make us think...

- Rats – we are being compared to rodents who are running in a circle getting nowhere
- Industrial look – factories – pollution
- “Just around the corner” means you are getting close, but we are actually getting nowhere (circle)
- Facial expressions – always stressed, unhappy, crazy, “rabies” rabid
- Darkness in the factories – as time goes on, we work later and later hours
- The placement of the “ads” for the rats, always right in front and it’s consuming
- Box – can’t escape
- Moving in the same direction – bandwagon
- Red used as color that stands out
- White, sameness of walls – rats only know one environment
Period 2: HOW does this cartoon make us think…

- The maze is endless. “Just around the corner” It will never stop.
- Posters are advertising materialistic things such as: vacations, products that will make you look better, feel better, be better.
- Red letters stand out – red means ALERT!
- This RAT RACE will make you crazy! The rats are frantic, desperate, exhausted, overworked.
- Factories are dark, smoking, working – poor working conditions, pollution – harming the environment.
- Maze gets filthy!
Use Handout “Questions for Analyzing Visual Text”
Use Handout “Questions for Analyzing Visual Text”
The political cartoon below and the Binyon article (in your packet) make similar claims about the Nobel Peace Prize awarded to President Barack Obama in 2009, but in very different ways. The Tom Toles cartoon appeared in the *Washington Post*; the article appeared in the *London Times*. Discuss the way each argument is developed and the likely impact of each on its audience.